

**STRAW PROPOSAL
FOR
SAFER ALTERNATIVE REGULATIONS
(10/1/09)**

**Article X. Identification and Prioritization of Chemicals of Concern in
Consumer Products**

6xxxx.1 Applicability

- (a) This Article applies to all consumer products that are made available for use in California and that are properly categorized as one or more of the following:
- (1) Products designed for use by infants or children, including, but not limited to, personal care products, toys, bedroom furnishings, and clothing;
 - (2) Products designed for use in K-12 schools;
 - (3) Products designed for application directly in or to the human body, including, but not limited to, personal care products, cosmetics, lipstick, nail polish, toothpaste, shampoos, perfumes and colognes;
 - (4) Clothing, linens and textiles including, but not limited to, shirts, blouses, socks, dresses, pants, handbags, shoes, pillow cases, bed covers, blankets, sheets, and mattress covers and liners;
 - (5) Furnishings including, but not limited to, mattresses, sofas, chairs, tables, draperies, household appliances, lighting fixtures, and carpet;
 - (6) Cleaning products including, but not limited to, kitchen and bathroom cleaning products, soaps, and laundry detergents;
 - (7) Products designed to release fragrances or scents, including, but not limited to, perfumes, colognes, scented candles, air fresheners and room deodorizers;
 - (8) Products designed to store or dispense food products or designed for food preparation including, but not limited to, bags or containers, flatware, eating and cooking utensils, and pots and pans;
 - (9) Products designed, or reasonably anticipated, to release any chemicals during intended use by consumers or after disposal (e.g., automobile brake pads, automobile tires, fireplace logs, glues, adhesives, and solvents);
 - (10) Any products that contain any of the chemicals specified in section 6xxxx.2 of this Article; and
 - (11) Any of the chemicals specified in section 6xxxx.2 of this Article.

1 (b) At least every two years following the effective date of these regulations,
2 the Department shall evaluate other categories of consumer products, and
3 may initiate a rulemaking to revise the list of product categories in
4 subsection (a) of this section.

5 **6xxxx.2 Designated Chemicals of Concern**

6 (a) Notwithstanding section 6xxxx.7 of this Article, the following chemicals or
7 chemical ingredients are “chemicals of concern”.

- 8 (1) Arsenic (inorganic arsenic compounds)
- 9 (2) Cadmium and cadmium compounds
- 10 (3) Chromium (VI) [CASRN 18540-29-9]
- 11 (4) Lead and lead compounds
- 12 (5) Mercury and mercury compounds
- 13 (6) Uranium [CASRN 7440-61-4]
- 14 (7) Bisphenol A [CASRN 80-05-7]
- 15 (8) Diethylhexyl phthalate [CASRN 117-81-7]
- 16 (9) Diisodecyl phthalate [CASRN 26761-40-0]
- 17 (10) Diacetyl [CASRN 431-03-8]
- 18 (11) Triclosan [CASRN 3380-34-5]
- 19 (12) Sulfur Dioxide [CASRN 7446-09-5]
- 20 (13) Nitrogen Dioxide [CASRN 10102-44-0]
- 21 (14) Methyl Isocyanate [CASRN 624-83-9]
- 22 (15) Perfluorooctanoic Acid
- 23 (16) Perflourooctane Sulfonate

24
25 (b) Any chemicals or chemical ingredients identified in any of the following
26 references:

- 27 (1) California Proposition 65 List of chemicals known to the state to
28 cause cancer or developmental or reproductive effect.
- 29 (2) International Agency for Research on Cancer, chemicals classified
30 as Groups 1, 2A and 2B carcinogens.
- 31 (3) National Toxicology Program (NTP) list of chemicals identified as
32 known or reasonably anticipated to be human carcinogens in the
33 Report on Carcinogens.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 (4.) Carcinogens classified by Europe as Categories 1 and 2, or with
2 Risk Phrases R45 (may cause cancer) or R49 (may cause cancer
3 by inhalation).
- 4 (5) NTP Center for Evaluation of Risks to Human Reproduction
5 (CERHR), chemicals classified as posing “serious concern,”
6 “concern” or “some concern” with regard to developmental or
7 reproductive toxicity
- 8 (6) Chemicals classified by the European Commission as Reproductive
9 Toxicity Categories 1 and 2, or in the hazard category for lactation
10 effects (effects on or via lactation) or with Risk Phrases R60 (may
11 impair fertility), R61 (may cause harm to the unborn child), and R64
12 (may cause harm to breastfed babies).
- 13 (7) Persistent, bioaccumulative toxicants (PBTs) and very persistent,
14 very bioaccumulative chemicals (vPvBs)
- 15 (8) Chemicals identified as persistent, bioaccumulative, inherently toxic
16 (PBIT) by Environment Canada.
- 17 (9) Chemicals identified by the European Commission as PBTs,
18 vPvBs
- 19 (10) Chemicals on the State of Washington PBT list.
- 20 (11) Oslo-Paris Convention Commission (OSPAR) list of substances of
21 possible concern (includes the subset of chemicals for priority
22 action).
- 23 (12) U.S. EPA National Waste Minimization Program Priority Chemicals.
- 24 (13) U.S. EPA Priority PBTs.
- 25 (14) U.S. EPA Emergency Planning and Community Right to Know Act
26 (EPCRA) PBTs.
- 27 (15) U.S. EPA Toxic Release Inventory (TRI) PBT Chemical List.
- 28 (16) Chemicals classified by the European Commission as Category 1
29 or 2 endocrine disruptors.
- 30 (17) Chemicals classified by the European Commission as Category 1
31 or 2 germ cell mutagens or with Risk Phrase R46 (may cause
32 heritable genetic damage).
- 33
- 34 (18) Japan International Center for Occupational Safety and Health list
35 of mutagenic chemicals.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 (19) Chemicals classified by Europe as respiratory sensitizers or with
2 Risk Phrases R42 (may cause sensitization by inhalation) and
3 R42/43 (may cause sensitization by inhalation and skin contact) .
- 4 (20) Chemicals identified by the Association of Occupational and
5 Environmental Clinics as occupational asthmagens.
- 6 (21) Chemicals classified by Canada as inherently toxic to aquatic
7 organisms.
- 8 (22) Chemicals classified by the European Commission as hazardous to
9 the aquatic environment.
- 10 (23) Chemicals classified by the European Commission as hazardous to
11 the ozone layer or with the Risk Phrase R59 (dangerous to the
12 ozone layer).
- 13 (24) California Toxic Air Contaminants Program.
- 14 (25) Potential chemical contaminants of concern at California school
15 sites.
- 16 (26) Priority chemicals for biomonitoring under the California
17 Environmental Contaminant Biomonitoring Program.
- 18 (27) Chemicals with drinking water maximum contaminant levels.
- 19 (28) Chemicals with water quality standards.
- 20 (29) Additional chemicals classified by Health Canada as high priorities
21 for human health.

22 **6xxxx.3 Definitions**

23 For the purposes of this article, the following terms have the meanings indicated:

- 24 (a) "Authoritative body" means any government agency, foreign or domestic,
25 that meets the following requirements:
- 26 (1) It characterizes chemicals pursuant to a process in which
27 stakeholders are able to participate and communicate through
28 written and oral comments.
- 29 (2) It publishes its characterization of chemicals via web postings,
30 press releases, government regulations, periodic reports,
31 monographs, or similar publications.
- 32 (b) Except as expressly stated otherwise, "chemical" means any chemical in a
33 consumer product other than a "chemical ingredient", as defined in
34 subsection (c) of this section .

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 (c) Except as expressly stated otherwise, “chemical ingredient” means any
2 chemical in a consumer product that is necessary for the manufacturing
3 process to produce a product that will function as intended.
- 4 (d) “Chemical of concern” (CoC) means:
- 5 (1) any chemical or chemical ingredient identified in section 6xxxx.2 of
6 this Article; and,
- 7 (2) any chemical or chemical ingredient that has any of the hazard
8 characteristics listed in section 6xxxx.7 of this Article, and is
9 contained in a category of consumer product that is subject to this
10 Article pursuant to Section 6xxxx.1.
- 11 (e) “Consumer product” has the meaning given to it by Health and Safety
12 Code section 25251, subdivision (e).
- 13 (f) “Existing chemical” means any chemical or chemical ingredient contained
14 in a consumer product, where that chemical or chemical ingredient was
15 being used in that product, and that product was being made available for
16 use in California before insert effective date of this article.
- 17 (g) “Make available for use in California” means that a person sells, offers to
18 sell, distributes, leases, offers to lease, supplies, or otherwise transfers
19 control over the disposition of a consumer product directly to a California
20 consumer; or to another person without maintaining sufficient control over
21 the distribution, sale, lease, supply, or other transfer of the consumer
22 product by that person to prevent the use of the consumer product by a
23 California consumer.
- 24 (h) “Manufacturer” means any person who imports, manufactures, assembles,
25 produces, or that packages, repackages, or re-labels under their own
26 brand name, a consumer product.
- 27 (i) “New chemical” means any chemical or chemical ingredient that was not
28 contained in a consumer product that was made available for use in
29 California before insert effective date of this article.
- 30 (j) “New use” refers to any use or application of any existing or new chemical
31 chemical ingredient in a consumer product that first occurs after insert
32 effective date of this article, in either a new or existing consumer
33 product that is or will be made available for use in California.
- 34 (k) “Sensitive subpopulations” means subgroups of the general population,
35 including, but not limited to, born and unborn infants, children, pregnant
36 women, the elderly, and individuals with chronic or acute illness, that may
37 be more susceptible than the general population to adverse impact from
38 exposure to certain chemicals or chemical ingredients.
- 39 (l) “Transferee” means: (1) a distributor, seller, supplier, lessor, or other
40 person who receives a right to use the product or to transfer an ownership

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 or other legal interest to use the product to another person, except that
2 manufacturers and consumers are not transferees.

3 **6xxxx.4 Standards for Consumer Products.**

4 (a) Except as provided in section 6xxxx.5 of this article, no person shall make
5 available for use in California any consumer product that is subject to this
6 article and has not been evaluated pursuant to sections 6xxxx.6, 6xxxx.7
7 and 6xxxx.8 of this article, or that lacks the documentation required by
8 section 6xxxx.9.

9 **6xxxx.5 Exemptions.**

10 (a) This article shall not apply to a consumer product that is made available
11 for use in California for the sole purpose of redistribution, sale, supply or
12 lease for use outside of California.

13 (b) This article shall not apply to a consumer product if any of the activities
14 prescribed in sections 6xxxx.6, 6xxxx.7, 6.xxxx.8 or 6.xxxx.9 are otherwise
15 prohibited by law.

16 **6xxxx.6 Data Requirements**

17 (a) Unless otherwise prohibited by law, a manufacturer of a consumer product
18 which does, or will, contain one or more existing or new chemicals shall
19 obtain all of the information and data necessary to evaluate those
20 chemicals pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article.

21 (b) The information required pursuant to subsection (a) of this section shall be
22 obtained by the following dates:

23 (1) For an “existing” chemical all information needed to evaluate that
24 chemical pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article shall be
25 generated no later than one year from the effective date of these
26 regulations.

27 (2) For new use of an “existing” chemical in a consumer product, all
28 information needed to evaluate that chemical or chemical ingredient
29 pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article shall be generated before
30 making that consumer product available for use in California.

31 (3) For a “new” chemical, all information needed to evaluate that
32 chemical pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article shall be
33 generated before making the new chemical available for use in
34 California.

35 (c) In complying with subsection (a) of this section, a person may:

36 (1) rely on published, peer-reviewed, scientific literature, published by
37 an independent third party; and/or,

38 (2) rely on evaluations and categorizations that have already been
39 performed by authoritative bodies (e.g., if an authoritative body has

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 already identified a chemical as a carcinogen, additional testing of
2 that chemical for carcinogenicity is not required); and/or
- 3 (3) conduct laboratory and analytical testing.
- 4 (d) Any data required to evaluate and categorize chemicals or chemical
5 ingredients pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article may be generated by
6 any applicable, standardized test method that is reasonably within the
7 capability of private sector laboratories to generate, or, by any test method
8 that it can be shown would be accepted as a valid test method by any
9 authoritative body for the respective categorization.
- 10 (e) Notwithstanding subsections (c) and (d) of this section, the use of
11 qualitative or quantitative structure-activity relationship ((QSAR) results
12 obtained from valid qualitative or quantitative structure-activity relationship
13 models QSARs) to categorize chemicals or chemical ingredients pursuant
14 to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article is acceptable in lieu of laboratory testing
15 if, and only if, the following conditions are met:
- 16 (1) results are derived from a QSAR model whose scientific validity
17 has been established by an authoritative body,
- 18 (2) the substance falls within the applicability domain of the QSAR
19 model,
- 20 (3) results are adequate for the purpose of risk assessment, and
- 21 (4) adequate and reliable documentation of the applied method is
22 submitted to the Department within 30 days of a written request by
23 the Department.
- 24 (f) Any test data and/or documentation that a person relies upon to comply
25 with the requirements of this Article shall be maintained by that person
26 while that person continues to make a product available for use in
27 California, and for a period of at least three years after that the last date
28 the person makes a product available for use in California. A copy of all
29 test data and/or documentation that person relied upon to achieve
30 compliance with this Article shall be made available to the Department
31 within 30 days of a written request from the Department.
- 32 (g) Individuals, members of industry trade associations, and/or any other
33 interested persons or stakeholders, may collaborate to collect the data
34 and documentation needed to achieve compliance with this article.
35 However, it is the responsibility of each manufacturer of a consumer
36 product that relies upon such data and documentation to ensure its
37 accuracy.
- 38 (h) Any person who is responsible for evaluating chemicals or chemical
39 ingredients pursuant to section 6xxxx.7 of this Article shall take all
40 reasonable steps, including, at a minimum, an annual review of available

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 information, to ensure that any data and/or documentation relied upon to
2 comply with section 6xxxx.7 of this Article is accurate and up-to-date.

3 **Section 6xxxx.7 Hazard Categories**

4 (a) Unless otherwise prohibited by law, a manufacturer of a consumer product
5 that contains one or more existing or new chemicals and who makes, or
6 will make, that product available for use in California shall take the
7 following actions:

8 (1) evaluate each chemical with respect to each of the hazard criteria
9 listed in subsection (b) of this section, until such time as the criteria
10 are modified or superseded by criteria published by the Office of
11 Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and posted on the
12 Toxics Information Clearinghouse website pursuant to Health and
13 Safety Code section 26256.1;

14 (2) determine and document all applicable hazard criteria from
15 subsection (b) of this section for which each specific chemical may
16 be designated as a chemical of concern. For example, if a
17 chemical may be categorized as a chemical of concern for
18 endocrine disruption, toxicity, carcinogenicity, and so on, those
19 results shall all be documented. If it is determined that a given
20 chemical is not a chemical of concern, that result shall also be
21 documented along with the basis for that determination;

22 (3) maintain all documentation relied upon to arrive at the
23 determinations specified in subsection (a) (2) of this section
24 during the time that the person makes that product using those
25 chemicals available for use in California, and for at least three
26 years thereafter. The manufacturer shall make the documentation
27 available to the Department within 30 days of a written request, and
28 shall also make the information generally available to any
29 interested parties by posting the information on the internet; and,

30 (4) enter the Chemical Abstracts Service (CAS) number, the name as
31 recognized by the International Union of Pure and Applied
32 Chemistry (IUPAC), and all hazard categorization information, as
33 determined pursuant to subsection (b) of this section, for each
34 chemical, into the Toxics Information Clearinghouse established by
35 the Department pursuant to section 25256 of the Health and Safety
36 Code within one year of the effective date of these regulations.

37 (b) Hazard criteria

38 (1) Toxicity

- 39 i. Acute toxicity (other than aquatic toxicity): Any chemicals
40 or chemical ingredients in consumer products with acute
41 toxicity values less than or equal to those shown in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Table 1, as measured by the oral, dermal or inhalation route, shall be designated as chemicals of concern based on acute toxicity.

Table 1. Acute Toxicity

Exposure Route	Values
Oral (mg/kg body weight)	≤ 50
Dermal (mg/kg bodyweight)	≤ 200
Gases (ppmV) ¹	≤ 500
Vapors (mg/L)	≤ 2.0
Dusts and Mists (mg/L)	≤ 0.5

(1) Gas concentrations are expressed in parts per million per volume (ppmV)

- ii. Chemicals or chemical ingredients with specific target organ toxicity-single exposure: Specific target organ toxicity (single exposure) is defined as specific non-lethal organ toxicity arising from a single exposure to a chemical or chemical ingredient. Those chemicals or chemical ingredients exhibiting any of the criteria listed in Table 2 at, or below, the concentration values listed in Table 3, shall be designated as a chemical of concern for specific target organ toxicity-single exposure.

Table 2. Characteristics for specific target organ toxicity-single exposure

Criteria
<p>Chemicals or chemical ingredients that have produced significant toxicity in humans, or, that on the basis of evidence from studies in experimental animals, can be presumed to have the potential to produce significant toxicity in humans following single exposure. Chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be classified on the basis of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • evidence from human cases or epidemiological studies; or • observations from appropriate studies in experimental animals in

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

which significant and/or severe toxic effects of relevance to human health were produced at generally low exposure concentrations; or,

- evidence from studies in experimental animals suggesting that the chemical or chemical ingredient can be presumed to have the potential to be harmful to human health following single exposure.

1
2
3
4

Table 3. Guidance Value Concentrations For Single-dose Exposures Which Have Produced A Significant Non-lethal Toxic Effect

Route of Exposure	Units	Concentration (C)
Oral (rat)	mg/kg body weight	$C \leq 2000$
Dermal (rat or rabbit)	mg/kg body weight	$C \leq 2000$
Inhalation (rat) gas	ppV/4h	$C \leq 20000$
Inhalation (rat) vapor	Mg/L4h	$C \leq 20$
Inhalation (rat) dust/mist/vapor	Mg/L4h	$C \leq 5$

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15

- iii. Chemical or chemical ingredients with target organ toxicity-repeated exposure: Target organ toxicity (repeated exposure) is defined as specific, target organ toxicity arising from a repeated exposure to a chemical or chemical ingredient. Those chemicals or chemical ingredients exhibiting any of the criteria listed in Table 4 at, or below, any concentration values listed in Table 5, shall be designated as a chemical of concern for target organ toxicity-repeated exposure.

1 **Table 4. Criteria for Specific Organ Toxicity-Repeated Exposure**

2

Criteria
<p>Chemicals or chemical ingredients that have produced significant toxicity in humans or that, on the basis of evidence from studies in experimental animals, can be presumed to have the potential to produce significant toxicity in humans, following repeated exposure. Chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be classified on the basis of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • evidence from human cases or epidemiological studies; or • observations from appropriate studies in experimental animals in which significant and/or severe toxic effects, of relevance to human health, were produced at generally low exposure concentrations; or, • evidence from studies in experimental animals suggesting that the chemical or chemical ingredient can be presumed to have the potential to be harmful to human health following repeated exposure.

3

4

5 **Table 5. Guidance Values To Assist In Classification**

6

Route of Exposure	Units	Guidance Values (Dose Concentration)
Oral (rat)	mg/kg body weight/day	C ≤ 100
Dermal (rat or rabbit)	mg/kg body weight/day	C ≤ 200
Inhalation (rat) gas	ppmV/6h/day	C ≤ 250
Inhalation (rat) vapor	mg/liter/6h/day	C ≤ 1
Inhalation (rat) dust/mist/fume	mg/liter/6h/day	C ≤ 0.2

7

8

9 (2) Chemicals or chemical ingredients which cause serious eye
10 damage: Serious eye damage means the production of tissue

1 damage in the eye, or serious physical decay of vision, following
2 application of a test substance to the anterior surface of the eye,
3 and which is not fully reversible within 21 days of application. Any
4 chemicals or chemical ingredients exhibiting any of the criteria in
5 Table 6 shall be designated as a chemical or chemical ingredient of
6 concern for serious eye damage.

7 **Table 6. Criteria For Adverse Eye Effects**

8

Criteria
<p>A chemical or chemical ingredient that when applied to the eye of an animal produces:</p> <p>effects in at least one animal on the cornea, iris or conjunctiva that are not expected to reverse or have not fully reversed within an observation period of normally 21 days; and/or</p> <p>in at least 2 of 3 tested animals, a positive response of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">-corneal opacity ≥ 3, and/or-iritis $> 1,5$, or <p>A chemical or chemical ingredient that when applied to the eye of an animal produces:</p> <p>in at least in 2 of 3 tested animals, a positive response of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">-corneal opacity ≥ 1 and/or-iritis ≥ 1, and/or-conjunctival redness ≥ 2 and/or-conjunctival oedema (chemosis) ≥ 2 <p>calculated as the mean scores following grading at 24, 48 and 72 hours after installation of the test material.</p>

9

10 (3) Germ cell mutagenicity and genetic toxicity: Chemicals or chemical
11 ingredients shall be designated chemicals of concern for germ cell
12 mutagenicity if they exhibit any of the criteria shown in Table 7.

1

2

Table 7. Criteria For Germ Cell Mutagens

3

Criteria
A. Any chemicals or chemical ingredients known to induce heritable mutations or that are regarded as if they induce heritable mutations in the germ cells of humans based on evidence from epidemiological studies, positive result(s) from in vivo heritable germ cell mutagenicity tests in mammals, or positive result(s) from in vivo somatic cell mutagenicity tests in mammals; or
B. Chemicals or chemical ingredients which may induce heritable mutations in the germ cells of humans, based on: <ul style="list-style-type: none">-positive evidence obtained from experiments in mammals and/or from in vitro experiments, obtained from:<ul style="list-style-type: none">-somatic cell mutagenicity tests in vivo, in mammals; or-other in vivo somatic cell genotoxicity tests which are supported by positive results from in vitro mutagenicity assays

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

(4) Reproductive Toxicity: Reproductive toxicity includes adverse effects on sexual function and fertility in males and females, as well as developmental toxicity in offspring. For the purpose of categorization for reproductive toxicity, any chemical or chemical ingredient meeting the criteria listed in Table 8 shall be designated as a chemical of concern for reproductive toxicity.

1

Table 8. Criteria For Reproductive Toxicants

2

Criteria
Known or presumed human reproductive toxicant-Chemicals or chemical ingredients that are known to have produced an adverse effect on sexual function and fertility, or on development, in humans, or, where there is evidence from animal studies to provide a strong presumption that the substance has the capacity to interfere with reproduction in humans; or
Suspected human reproductive toxicant-Chemicals or chemical ingredients for which there is some evidence from humans or experimental animals, possibly supplemented with other information, of an adverse effect on sexual function and fertility, or on development.

3

- (5) Carcinogenicity: A chemical or chemical ingredient that has not been tested for carcinogenicity may be classified based on tumor data from a structural analogue, together with consideration of other important factors such as formation of common significant metabolites; e.g. for benzidine congener dyes. Any chemical or chemical ingredient meeting the hazard criteria shown in Table 9 shall be designated as a chemical of concern for carcinogenicity.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

Table 9. Criteria For Carcinogens

13

Criteria
Any known or presumed human carcinogens, or suspected human carcinogens, as designated by any authoritative body.

14

- (6) Endocrine disruptors: Any chemical or chemical ingredient that has been characterized by any authoritative body as showing evidence of endocrine disrupting activity in at least one species using intact animals; or, showing at least some *in vitro* evidence of biological activity related to endocrine disruption, shall be designated as a chemical of concern for endocrine disruption.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- (7) Respiratory sensitizers: Chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be evaluated in accordance with the criteria presented in Table 10.

22

23

1 Evidence that a chemical or chemical ingredient can induce specific
2 respiratory hypersensitivity will normally be based on human
3 experience. In this context, hypersensitivity is normally seen as
4 asthma, but other hypersensitivity reactions such as
5 rhinitis/conjunctivitis and alveolitis shall also be considered. Any
6 chemical or chemical ingredient that exhibits the criteria listed in
7 Table 10 shall be designated as a chemical of concern for
8 respiratory sensitization.

9
10 **Table 10. Criteria For Respiratory Sensitizers**

11

Criteria
Chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be classified as respiratory sensitizers in accordance with the following criteria: (a) if there is evidence in humans that the substance can lead to specific respiratory hypersensitivity; and/or, (b) if there are positive results from an appropriate animal test.

12
13 (8) Skin sensitizers: Chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be
14 evaluated in accordance with the criteria in Table 11. For
15 classification as a skin sensitizer, evidence may include, but is not
16 limited to, any or all of the following:

- 17 1. positive data from patch testing, normally obtained in more than
18 one dermatology clinic;
19 2. epidemiological studies showing allergic contact dermatitis
20 caused by the substance; positive data from appropriate animal
21 studies;
22 3. positive data from experimental studies on humans;
23 4. well-documented episodes of allergic contact dermatitis,
24 normally obtained in more than one dermatology clinic.

25 Any chemical or chemical ingredient categorized as a skin
26 sensitizer pursuant to these criteria, or those shown in Table 11,
27 shall be designated as a chemical of concern for skin sensitization.

28

1

Table 11. Hazard Criteria For Skin Sensitizers

2

Criteria
A chemical or chemical ingredient shall be classified as a skin sensitizer in accordance with the following criteria:
(i) if there is evidence in humans that the substance can lead to sensitization by skin contact in a substantial number of persons; or,
(ii) if there are positive results from an appropriate animal test.

3

(9) Bioaccumulation; The potential for bioaccumulation shall be determined by using either the octanol/water partition coefficient, reported as a log K_{ow} , or its equivalent, or the “bioconcentration factor”. The relationship between the log K_{ow} of an organic substance and its bioconcentration as measured by its bioconcentration factor (BCF) in fish is well documented. The experimentally determined BCF provides a better measure and shall be used in preference to the log K_{ow} if available. A BCF in fish of ≥ 500 shall be considered indicative of the potential to bioconcentrate for classification purposes. Any chemical or chemical ingredient with a log $K_{ow} \geq 4$ or a BCF ≥ 500 shall be considered as having a real potential to bioaccumulate, and shall be designated as a chemical of concern for bioaccumulation.

17

(10) Acute aquatic toxicity: Criteria are summarized in Table 12. The system consists of acute and chronic classification categories. The acute and chronic classification categories shall be applied independently. Any chemical or chemical ingredient exhibiting acute or chronic toxicity at or below the concentration ranges given in Table 12, shall be designated as an aquatic toxicant and a chemical of concern for aquatic toxicity.

24

Table 12. Hazard Criteria for aquatic toxicants

Criteria	
Acute (short-term) aquatic hazard	
96 hr LC50 (for fish)	≤ 1 mg/l and/or

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

48 hr EC50 (for crustacea)	≤ 1 mg/l and/or
72 or 96 hr ErC50 (for algae or other aquatic plants)	≤ 1 mg/l.
Chronic (long-term) aquatic hazard	
96 hr LC50 (for fish)	≤ 10 mg/l and/or
48 hr EC50 (for crustacea)	≤ 10 mg/l and/or
72 or 96 hr ErC50 (for algae or other aquatic plants)	≤ 10 mg/l
and the substance is not rapidly degradable and/or the experimentally determined BCF ≥ 500 (or, if absent, the log Kow ≥ 4).	
'Safety net' classification	
This applies in cases when data do not allow classification under the above criteria but there are nevertheless grounds for concern. This includes, for example, poorly soluble chemicals or chemical ingredients for which no acute toxicity is recorded at levels up to the water solubility, and which are not rapidly degradable, and have an experimentally determined BCF ≥ 500 (or, if absent, a log Kow ≥ 4), indicating a potential to Bioaccumulate. Such chemicals or chemical ingredients shall be classified as chemicals or chemical ingredients of concern.	

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15

(11) Substances hazardous to the ozone layer: A chemical or chemical ingredient shall be classified as hazardous to the ozone layer, and thus as a chemical of concern, if available evidence concerning its properties, and/or its predicted or observed environmental fate and behavior, indicate that it may present a danger to the structure and/or the functioning of the stratospheric ozone layer. Mixtures shall be classified as hazardous to the ozone layer on the basis of the individual concentration of the chemicals or chemical ingredients contained in the mixture that are classified as Hazardous to the Ozone Layer, in accordance with Table 13. In addition, any chemical or chemical ingredient that has been designated as hazardous to the ozone layer by any authoritative body shall be designated as a chemical of concern for hazardous to the ozone layer.

1 **Table 13. Generic Concentration Limit For Chemicals (In A Mixture)**
2 **Classified As Hazardous To The Ozone Layer, That Trigger Classification**
3 **Of The Mixture As Hazardous To The Ozone Layer**

Classification Of The Substance	Classification Of The Mixture
Hazardous To The Ozone Layer	Concentration > 0.1%

4

5 **6xxxx.8 Prioritization of Chemicals of Concern**

6 (a) Unless otherwise prohibited by law, a manufacturer of a consumer product
7 that contains one or more chemicals of concern who makes or will make
8 that product available for use in California, shall determine the appropriate
9 priority for each chemical of concern contained in that product based on
10 the following:

- 11 (1) Priority 1 chemicals of concern include any new or existing
12 chemical that is identified as a chemical of concern and that is:
- 13 a. Reasonably anticipated to be released to the environment
14 during use, reuse, reclamation, or during or after disposal of the
15 consumer product, or during reasonably foreseeable use of the
16 consumer product (e.g., children putting toys into their mouths);
17 or,
 - 18 b. to which humans are being or have been exposed based on
19 data from the California Environmental Contaminant
20 Biomonitoring Program, or any other biomonitoring studies
21 conducted by an authoritative body under appropriate scientific
22 guidelines and procedures.
- 23 (2) Priority 2 chemicals of concern include any new or existing
24 chemical identified as a chemical of concern and that does not
25 otherwise meet the priority 1 criteria described in subsection (a)(1)
26 of this section, and that is encapsulated in such a manner that it will
27 not be released to the environment during the normal intended use
28 of the consumer product containing the chemical or chemical
29 ingredient, but it may be released to the environment during
30 reclamation or disposal.
- 31 (3) Priority 3 chemicals of concern include any new or existing
32 chemical identified as a chemical of concern and that does not
33 otherwise meet the priority 1 or 2 criteria described in subsections
34 (a)(1) or (2) of this section, respectively, and that is encapsulated in
35 such a manner that it will not be released to the environment during
36 the normal intended use of the consumer product containing the
37 chemical or chemical ingredient, or during reclamation or disposal.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (b) The prioritization required pursuant to subsection (a) of this section shall
2 be obtained by the following dates:

3 (1) For an “existing” chemical, no later than one year from the effective
4 date of these regulations.

5 (2) For an “existing” chemical in a “new use” application, before making
6 any consumer product containing the new use application of that
7 chemical available for use in California.

8 (3) For a “new” chemical, before making the consumer product
9 containing the new chemical available for use in California.

10
11 **6xxxx.9 Supply Chain Information Dissemination Requirements**

12 (a) Unless otherwise prohibited by law, a manufacturer of a consumer product
13 that contains one or more priority 1, 2, or 3 chemicals of concern, as described in
14 section 6xxxx.8 of this article, who makes that product available for use in
15 California, either through one or more transferees or directly to a consumer, shall
16 provide each of its transferees, or its direct consumer, as appropriate, with
17 documentation that does the following:

18 (1) identifies the respective hazard categories for the chemicals of
19 concern contained in the product (e.g., acute toxicity,
20 carcinogenicity, reproductive toxicity, etc.) and their respective
21 priority, as determined pursuant to sections 6xxxx.7 and 6.xxxx.8 of
22 this Article, respectively;

23 (2) identifies possible routes of exposure to the chemicals of concern
24 contained in the product;

25 (3) provides notice that the product is subject to the alternatives
26 analysis requirement pursuant to Article XX, and specifies the date
27 by which the alternatives analysis shall be completed pursuant to
28 Article XX;

29 (4) identifies the date on which the alternatives analysis was
30 completed, as applicable; and,

31 (5) specifies the address and contact information where a copy of all
32 documentation required to show compliance with this Article, and
33 Article XX, may be obtained upon written request by the
34 Department.

35 (b) Notwithstanding subsection (a) of this section, if the manufacturer of a
36 consumer product who makes that product available for use in California,
37 either through one or more transferees or directly to a consumer,
38 determines that the product does not contain a chemical of concern, the
39 manufacturer shall provide each of its transferees, or its direct consumer,
40 as appropriate, with documentation stating that the respective product

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 does not contain any chemicals of concern, and specifying the address
2 and contact information where a copy of all documentation required to
3 show compliance with this Article may be requested in writing by the
4 Department, including all documentation that was relied upon to make the
5 determination that the product in question does not contain any chemicals
6 of concern.

7 (c) A manufacturer is prohibited from making a consumer product available
8 for use in California unless the manufacturer provides the documentation
9 required by subsections (a) or (b) of this section, as applicable, to each of
10 its transferees, or to its direct California consumers, as appropriate.

11 (d) The manufacturer shall maintain all documentation relied upon to achieve
12 compliance with this Article during the time that manufacturer makes that
13 product available for use in California, and for at least three years
14 thereafter. The manufacturer shall make all documentation relied upon to
15 achieve compliance with this Article available to the Department within 30
16 days of a written request from the Department.

17 (e) A transferee in a distribution system for a product made available for use
18 in California shall not transfer a consumer product to the next person in
19 the distribution system, or directly sell, lease or supply a consumer
20 product to a California consumer, without also concurrently providing that
21 person with the documentation required by subsection (a) of this section.

22 (f) Each transferee shall keep a copy of the documentation required by
23 subsections (a) or (b) of this section for a period of three years following
24 the last date the consumer product was transferred to the next person in
25 the distribution system, or directly to a California consumer, as
26 appropriate, and for at least three years thereafter. Each person in the
27 distribution system shall make that documentation available to the
28 Department within 30 days of a written request from the Department.

29
30 **Article XX. Alternatives Analysis**

31 **Section 6xxxx.10. Applicability**

32 (a) Any consumer product made available for use in California that contains
33 one or more prioritized chemicals of concern, as determined pursuant to
34 Article X, shall be evaluated in accordance with the alternatives analysis process
35 contained in this article.

36 (b) A manufacturer of a consumer product to which this article applies shall
37 evaluate the product using the alternatives analysis process contained in this
38 article.

39 (c) The alternatives analysis required by this article shall include the following
40 components:

41 (1) Identification of all potential alternatives pursuant to section
42 6xxxx.12;

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (2) Comparison of each potential alternative with the consumer product
2 based on the hazard categories specified in Article X for the chemicals of
3 concern in the consumer product pursuant to section 6xxxx.13;

4 (3) Identification and evaluation of the potential hazards, critical
5 exposure pathways and life cycle impacts associated with the subject consumer
6 product and with the identified potential alternatives pursuant to sections
7 6xxxx.14 through 6xxxx.17.

8 (d) The alternatives analysis required by this article shall be completed on or
9 before one year from the date of completion of the hazard categorization required
10 in section 6xxxx.7.

11 (e) Notwithstanding subsections (b) and (d), the Department may grant a
12 petition for a variance for any provision in this article pursuant to section
13 6xxxx.21.

14
15 **Section 6xxxx.10.1. Standards for Consumer Products.**

16 (a) Except as provided in section 6xxxx.10.2 of this article, no person shall
17 make available for use in California any consumer product that is subject to this
18 article, but has not been evaluated pursuant to sections 6xxxx.12 through
19 6xxxx.18.

20 (b) Except as provided in section 6xxxx.10.2 of this article, no person shall
21 make available for use in California any consumer product that is subject to this
22 article, or safer alternative thereto, that has been evaluated pursuant to sections
23 6xxxx.12 through 6xxxx.18 of this article, but for which the response actions
24 required by section 6xxxx.20 have not been taken.

25
26 **6xxxx.10.2. Exemptions.**

27 (a) This article shall not apply to a consumer product that is made available
28 for use in California for the sole purpose of redistribution, sale or lease for use
29 outside of California.

30 (b) This article shall not apply to a consumer product, or any safer alternative
31 thereto, if any of the applicable requirements prescribed in sections 6xxxx.12
32 through 6xxxx.20 are otherwise prohibited by law.

33
34 **Section 6xxxx.11. Definitions**

35 When used in this article, the following terms have the meanings given below:

36
37 “Acidification” means the potential of emissions such as sulfur dioxide
38 (SO₂), nitrogen oxides (NO_x), ammonia (NH₃), hydrochloric acid (HCl), etc. to
39 directly or after conversion to other substances lower the pH of soil and water
40 bodies.

41
42 “Air emissions” means air pollutants including ozone precursors,
43 particulate matter (both PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5}), and secondary organic aerosols; air
44 toxics; stratospheric ozone depleting compounds, and greenhouse
45 gases/materials.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2 “Allocation” means the partitioning and attribution of input or output flows
3 of a process or a product system.
4

5 “Chemical of concern” (CoC) has the meaning given to it in section
6 6xxxx.3.
7

8 “Climate change” means the condition caused by the greenhouse effect
9 which is induced by greenhouse gas emissions. Global Warming Potential
10 means the value as specified in the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
11 (IPCC) 1995 Second Assessment Report (SAR), as reported in Table 2.14, in
12 Climate Change 2007: The Physical Sciences Basis. Contribution of Working
13 Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report (FAR) of the Intergovernmental Panel
14 on Climate Change.
15

16 “Data quality” means a method for evaluating the quality of data that
17 includes technological, geographical and time-related representativeness, as well
18 as completeness and precision.
19

20 “Ecotoxicity” means an attribute that addresses impacts to ecosystems as
21 a result of toxicological mechanisms due to exposure to substances in the
22 environment. (e.g., the potential for biological, chemical or physical stressors to
23 affect or to disrupt the natural biochemistry, physiology, behavior and interactions
24 of the living organisms that comprise the ecosystem.)
25

26 “Emission” means a chemical or physical discharge (e.g., of a substance,
27 heat, noise.) into the environment.
28

29 “End-of-life” means a product at the end of its useful life that will undergo
30 waste management or reuse.
31

32 “Environmental assessment” means a detailed study of the reasonably
33 foreseeable significant effects on the environment, beneficial as well as adverse,
34 of a product, service or process. Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) and
35 Environmental Risk Assessment (ERA) are examples.
36

37 “Environmental impact” means any change to the environment, whether
38 adverse or beneficial, wholly or partially resulting from an activity, product or
39 service.
40

41 “Eutrophication” means excessive enrichment of terrestrial and aquatic
42 ecosystems with nutrients such as nitrogen and phosphorus, and the associated
43 adverse biological effects, resulting in changed species composition, especially
44 displacement of sensitive species. (e.g., the degradation of excess organic

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 material in receiving waters consumes oxygen resulting in oxygen deficiency and
2 fish kill.)
3

4 “Functional unit” means the properties of a product used to establish a
5 standardized frame of reference for comparison. A product property is to be
6 included in the functional unit when it is an obligatory product property, e.g., a
7 property that the alternative product must have in order to be at all considered as
8 a relevant alternative. The functional unit describes and quantifies those
9 properties of the product that must be present for the studied substitution to take
10 place. These properties (e.g., the functionality, appearance, stability, durability,
11 ease of maintenance) are in turn determined by the requirements in the market in
12 which the product is to be sold.
13

14 “Functionally equivalent” means an alternative that performs the same
15 function as the consumer product. This is determined by the person conducting
16 the alternatives analysis and is likely to be product- and process-specific.
17

18 “Global warming” means changes in the global, average surface-air
19 temperature and subsequent change of various climate parameters and their
20 effects such as storm frequency and intensity, rainfall intensity and frequency of
21 flooding.
22

23 “Human toxicity” means the degree to which a chemical or chemical
24 ingredient elicits a deleterious or adverse effect upon the biological system of
25 humans exposed to the chemical or chemical ingredient over a designated time
26 period.
27

28 “Impact assessment” means the third phase of an LCA. This phase is
29 concerned with understanding and evaluating the magnitude and significance of
30 the potential environmental impacts of the product(s) under study.
31

32 “Input” means a material or energy flow that enters a unit process
33 including raw materials, intermediate products, co-products, and waste for
34 treatment.
35

36 “Land use” means the use of land and/or the change of that use,
37 considering land occupation as well as transformation impacts related to use and
38 conversion (transformation) of land area by product-related activities such as
39 agriculture, roads, housing, mining, etc. Land occupation considers the effects of
40 the land use, the amount of area involved and the duration of its occupation
41 (quality-changes multiplied with area and duration). Land transformation
42 considers the extent of changes in land properties and the area affected (quality
43 changes multiplied by the area).
44

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 “Life cycle” means consecutive and interlinked stages of a product system,
2 including initial design, raw material acquisition, manufacturing, and use to final
3 disposal.
4

5 “Life Cycle Assessment (LCA)” means the compilation and evaluation of
6 the inputs, outputs and the potential environmental impacts of a product system
7 throughout its life cycle.
8

9 “Make available for use in California” has the meaning given to it in
10 section 6xxxx.3.
11

12 “Output” means a product, material or energy flow that leaves a unit
13 process including raw materials, intermediate products, co-products, wastes and
14 releases (e.g., emissions to air and discharges to water and soil).
15

16 “Potential alternative” means a change in chemicals, materials, production
17 processes or design for a particular product. Potential alternatives may include,
18 but are not limited to, alternatives resulting in chemical substitution or elimination,
19 process change, material substitution, product redesign, or a change in systems
20 or operations.
21

22 “Primary data” means data that are collected, measured or estimated
23 specifically for a product system.
24

25 “Process” means a set of interrelated or interacting activities that
26 transforms inputs into outputs.
27

28 “Resource depletion” addresses impacts due to the use of natural
29 resources, either renewable or non-renewable, and either biotic or abiotic.
30

31 “Safer alternative” means a potential alternative for a product that results
32 in reduced hazard, exposure and ecological impacts without resulting in
33 significant life cycle impacts.
34

35 “Secondary data” means data gathered from other than primary
36 sources,(e.g. data base, industry, literature or governmental sources)
37

38 “Sensitivity and uncertainty analysis” means a step of the LCA
39 Interpretation phase to assess the robustness of the overall LCA results with
40 respect to variations and uncertainties in the system boundaries, methods and
41 data used. These analyses provide systematic procedures for estimating the
42 effects of the choices made regarding methods and data on the outcome of a
43 study.
44

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 “Societal cost” means the external costs of an activity, product or system
2 (e.g., not including the value of all the resources used in providing a product or
3 service), including the value of all resulting impacts to human health and the
4 environment from production, use and end-of-life. The sum of the costs of
5 externalities (societal) and the priced resources makes up the total cost.

6
7 “Substitution” means the replacement or reduction of hazardous
8 substances in products and processes by less hazardous or non-hazardous
9 substances.

10
11 “System boundary” means a set of criteria specifying which unit processes
12 are part of a product system to identify the interface between that product system
13 and the environment or other product systems.

14
15 “Transparency” means an open, comprehensive and understandable
16 presentation of information.

17
18 “Terrestrial toxicity” means an attribute that addresses impacts to
19 terrestrial ecosystems as a result of toxicological mechanisms due to exposure to
20 substances in the environment. (e.g., the potential for biological, chemical or
21 physical stressors to affect or to disrupt the natural biochemistry, physiology,
22 behavior and interactions of the living organisms that comprise the ecosystem.)

23
24 “Uncertainty” means the lack of certainty such as in the prediction of a
25 certain outcome, in a measurement, or in an assessment results. It is a general
26 term used to cover any distribution of data caused by either random variation,
27 measurement precision or bias. In LCA, evaluation or measurement of
28 uncertainty is an on-going process and relates to all the elements of data quality.

29
30 “Unit process” means the smallest portion of a product system for which
31 data are analyzed when performing a life cycle assessment.

32
33 **Section 6xxx.12. Identification of Potential Alternatives**

34 (a) A manufacturer shall identify all functionally equivalent potential
35 alternatives using information regarding the production, use and disposal of the
36 chemical of concern and the consumer product containing the chemical of
37 concern throughout the life cycle and any other information the person
38 conducting the analysis deems to be relevant. To identify potential alternatives
39 the manufacturer shall consider all of the following factors:

- 40 (1) the function of the consumer product;
41 (2) the function of the chemical of concern in the consumer product;
42 (3) the performance factors relevant to the specific function of the
43 consumer product and specific function of the chemical of concern in the
44 consumer product.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (b) If no potential alternative is identified for the consumer product, all of the
2 following requirements shall apply:

3 (1) The consumer product shall be subject to the response action
4 specified in section 6xxx.20(b)(1)(B), 6xxx.20(b)(1)(D), or 6xxx.20(d)(3), if
5 authorized by the Department;

6 (2) The manufacturer shall document the identification of alternatives,
7 including all of the information compiled to complete subsections (a) and (b) of
8 this section, and retain this documentation until a new alternatives analysis is
9 completed;

10 (3) The manufacturer shall provide notification to the Department that
11 no potential alternative was identified, as described in the requirements for the
12 alternatives analysis findings report in accordance with section 6xxx.17(b) and
13 the date of this notification shall be added to the supply chain documentation
14 required pursuant to section 6xxx.9;

15 (4) The alternative analysis process specified in this article shall be
16 repeated no later than two years from the date that the notification required
17 pursuant to subsection (b)(3) was provided to the Department.
18

19 **Section 6xxx.13. Hazard Categorization Comparison**

20 (a) For each potential alternative identified pursuant to section 6xxx.12, a
21 person conducting the alternatives analysis shall perform hazard categorization
22 in accordance with the process specified in Article X to identify chemicals of
23 concern in the potential alternative(s).
24

25 (b) If a potential alternative is found to use or contain a chemical of concern
26 that is assigned to the same hazard categories as the chemical of concern in the
27 consumer product, the following shall apply:

28 (1) If the chemical of concern in the potential alternative has been
29 assigned to any additional hazard categories, the alternative shall be eliminated
30 from further consideration as a potential alternative, unless the analyst
31 demonstrates through the assessment of hazards, exposure and life cycle
32 impacts outlined in this article that use of the chemical of concern in the potential
33 alternative results in no relevant risk of exposure during reasonably foreseeable
34 use of the product.

35 (2) If all of the potential alternatives identified pursuant to section
36 6xxx.12 are eliminated from further consideration, the following requirements
37 shall apply:

38 (A) The consumer product shall be subject to the response action
39 specified in section 6xxx.20(b)(1)(B), 6xxx.20(b)(1)(D), or
40 6xxx.20(d)(3), if imposed by the Department;

41 (B) The manufacturer shall document the hazard categorization
42 comparison of the potential alternatives, including all of the
43 information compiled to complete subsections (a) and (b) of
44 this section, and retain this documentation in accordance with
45 section 6xxx.xx;

- 1 (C) The manufacturer shall provide notification to the Department
2 that all potential alternatives have been eliminated from
3 consideration, as described in the requirements for the
4 alternatives analysis findings report in accordance with section
5 6xxx.17(c) and the date of this notification shall be added to
6 the supply chain documentation required pursuant to section
7 6xxx.6;
- 8 (D) The alternative analysis process specified in this article shall
9 be repeated no later than two years from the date that the
10 most recent hazard categorization comparison required by this
11 section was completed.
12

13 **Section 6xxx.14. General Requirements for Assessment of Hazards,
14 Exposure and Life Cycle Impacts**

- 15 (a) A person conducting the alternatives assessment shall ensure that the
16 assessment of the hazards, exposure and life cycle impacts of a product and
17 potential alternatives meets the following general requirements:
- 18 (1) Relevance: The information sources, data and methods used to
19 conduct the analysis are appropriate to the assessment of the impacts arising
20 from the product and alternative(s) under study;
- 21 (2) Completeness: The assessment includes all inputs and outputs that
22 provide a material contribution to the assessment of impacts;
- 23 (3) Consistency: The data and information used provides meaningful
24 comparisons of results;
- 25 (4) Accuracy: Bias and uncertainties are minimized;
- 26 (5) Transparency: Sufficient information is disclosed to allow other
27 persons to validate results and make associated decisions with confidence.
28
- 29 (b) The alternatives assessment shall identify impacts associated with
30 implementation of alternatives, including, but not limited to:
- 31 (1) Increased hazard
32 (2) Increased exposure
33 (3) Increased negative life cycle impacts
34 (4) Increased ecological impacts
35

36 **Section 6xxx.15. Methodological Approach for Assessment of Hazards
37 and Exposure**

- 38 (a) For the product and any alternatives that have not been eliminated in
39 section 6xxx.13(b), hazard and exposure information shall be collected for each
40 chemical of concern identified in the consumer product and alternatives as
41 specified below:
42
- 43 (b) Hazard information shall be collected for the specified criteria, until such
44 time as the criteria are modified or superseded by criteria published by the Office
45 of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment and posted on the Toxics

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

Information Clearinghouse website. These criteria shall be evaluated in accordance with the procedure contained in section 6xxxx.7 and quantitative results shall be collected:

- (1) Acute toxicity
- (2) Specific target organ toxicity (single exposure)
- (3) Target organ toxicity (repeated exposure)
- (4) Adverse eye effects
- (5) Mutagenicity and genetic toxicity
- (6) Reproductive toxicity
- (7) Carcinogenicity
- (8) Endocrine disruption
- (9) Respiratory sensitization
- (10) Skin sensitization
- (11) Bioaccumulation
- (12) Aquatic toxicity
- (13) Hazardous to the ozone layer

(c) Exposure information shall be collected for the following properties and evaluated by assigning a high, medium or low impact assessment in accordance with the criteria depicted in Table XX – Impact Assessment Criteria:

- (1) Potential dermal contact with the chemical of concern during intended product use
- (2) Potential ingestion of the chemical of concern during intended product use
- (3) Potential inhalation of the chemical of concern during intended product use.

Table XX – Impact Assessment Criteria for Exposure

Potential dermal contact with COC during product use	Dermal contact > 8 hours/day	Dermal contact < 8 hours/day	No known or suspected dermal contact
Potential ingestion of COC during product use	Known ingestion potential	Suspected ingestion potential	No known or suspected ingestion potential
Potential inhalation of COC during product use	Inhalation contact > 8 hours/day	Inhalation contact < 8 hours/day	No known or suspected inhalation potential

1

2 **Section 6xxxx.16. Methodological Approach for Assessment of Life Cycle**
3 **Impacts**

4 (a) For the product and each potential alternative that has not been eliminated
5 in section 6xxxx.13(b), the life cycle impacts shall be determined as described in
6 this section.

7

8 (b) The following approach shall be taken to determine if significant impacts
9 would result from a potential alternative:

- 10 (1) Review any differences in the functionality or use phase lifetime of the
11 product and the alternatives and find equivalence so that comparison
12 can be made.
- 13 (2) Assess any significant differences in inputs and outputs from raw
14 materials acquisition to end-of-life phases of the product and
15 alternative lifecycles.
- 16 (3) For those phases with significant differences, find relevant and most
17 representative data to assess the impacts associated with the product
18 and the alternatives,
- 19 (4) Assign data to impact categories, assess the impacts, and quantify
20 differences between the product and the alternatives,
- 21 (5) Identify improvements that can be made to reduce any significant
22 trade-offs identified between each alternative and the product, and
23 refine the impact results noting if the modifications result in
24 functionality differences or in significant changes in any excluded life
25 cycle phases.

26

27 (c) Functional equivalence

28 The impact assessment specified in this section shall apply to the original
29 product and functionally equivalent alternatives. A general description of the
30 product and its intended and reasonably foreseeable uses shall be provided as
31 supporting information. Comparisons between alternatives and the original
32 product shall be made on the basis of the same function(s), quantified by the
33 same functional unit(s).

34

35 (d) Life Cycle system boundary and initial review

36 The system boundary and all underlying processes shall be clearly defined for
37 each product and alternative(s) as well as underlying processes. Comparable life
38 cycle phases may be identified. The boundary can be reduced based on
39 equivalence for comparative evaluations. The specific life cycle phases,
40 processes, inputs and outputs that shall be included at a minimum are those that
41 exhibit or may exhibit a significant difference between the original product and
42 the given alternatives under study. Such phases include:

43

(1) Raw materials,

44

(2) Energy consumption,

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 (3) Manufacturing,
- 2 (4) Transportation,
- 3 (5) Use, and
- 4 (6) End-of-life.

5 Each life cycle phase shall be reviewed to determine if significant differences in
6 the inputs or outputs, costs and energy use for each step or process is found.
7 The entire life cycle shall be considered unless specific life cycle phases or
8 processes have been deemed equivalent and excluded from further study.

9
10 (e) Information/data collection

11 (1) The qualitative information and quantitative data collected for the analysis
12 shall be relevant to all impacts occurring within the system boundary of the
13 product and alternatives under comparison. When information and data, whether
14 measured, calculated or estimated, have been collected from public sources, the
15 source shall be referenced. Qualitative information may be gathered when
16 quantitative data are not available or accessible.

17
18 (2) When identifying data for use, preference shall be given as follows:

- 19 (A) For time-related coverage: data that are time-specific to the
20 product being assessed shall be preferred (e.g., age of data and
21 the minimum length of time over which data are collected).
22 Where the data associated with any life cycle phase of a
23 product vary over time, the data shall be collected over a period
24 of time sufficient to establish the data needed to characterize
25 the life cycle of the product and its alternative(s). Where a
26 product is made available on a continuing basis, the information
27 used for the assessment of impacts shall cover at least one
28 year. Where a product or a component part is differentiated by
29 time (e.g. seasonal products), the information collected shall
30 cover the particular period associated with the production of the
31 product or component;
- 32 (B) For geographical specificity: data that are geographically-
33 specific to the product being assessed shall be preferred (e.g.
34 district, country, region);
- 35 (C) For technology coverage: data that are technology-specific to
36 the product being assessed shall be preferred (e.g., whether the
37 data relates to a specific technology or a mix of technologies);
- 38 (D) For accuracy of the information: data that are most accurate
39 shall be preferred (e.g. data, models and assumptions);
- 40 (E) For precision: data that are more precise (i.e. has the lowest
41 statistical variance) shall be preferred (i.e., measure of the
42 variability of the data);
- 43 (F) For completeness: the data that are primary, and the degree to
44 which the data represents the population of interest shall be

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 preferred (i.e., the sample size is large enough, the periodicity of
2 measurement is sufficient, etc.);
- 3 (G) For consistency: data selection that is carried out uniformly in
4 the various components of the analysis shall be preferred; and
- 5 (H) For reproducibility: methods and data values that would allow an
6 independent practitioner to reproduce the results reported in the
7 study shall be preferred.
- 8 (I) The uncertainties of the information and the assumptions made
9 when collecting data shall be stated relevant to the criteria
10 above.
- 11
- 12 (3) The economic and environmental information shall be collected for
13 each process included in the system boundary under study as specified
14 below:
- 15 (A) Environmental Information:
- 16 (i) materials consumption
- 17 (ii) ancillary materials consumption including recyclable material
18 content
- 19 (iii) energy consumption and demand
- 20 (iv) water consumption
- 21 (v) air emissions
- 22 (vi) solid waste raw
- 23 (vii) wastewater releases
- 24 (viii) liquid waste
- 25 (ix) end of life options
- 26 (x) reusability and recyclability
- 27 (xi) land use change
- 28 (B) Economic Information:
- 29 (i) capital investment
- 30 (ii) operations and maintenance cost
- 31 (iii) cost for resources
- 32 (iv) energy costs
- 33 (v) insurance and other internal costs
- 34 (vi) byproduct value
- 35 (vii) waste disposal and treatment cost
- 36 (viii) outsourced service cost
- 37 (ix) corporate image and brand value
- 38 (x) consumer acceptance
- 39 (xi) worker wellness and morale
- 40 (xii) external costs, such as societal health costs and
41 environmental damage costs
- 42 (xiii) non-compliance liability
- 43
- 44 (f) Impact assessment

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (1) The selection of impact categories shall reflect a comprehensive
2 set of environmental and economic characteristics related to the product system
3 being studied. A set of impact categories shall include, but not be limited to:

4 (A) Ecological impacts

- 5 (i) Global warming
- 6 (ii) Acidification
- 7 (iii) Terrestrial toxicity
- 8 (iv) Photochemical smog
- 9 (v) Stratospheric Ozone depletion
- 10 (vi) Eutrophication
- 11 (vii) Water quality (e.g. BOD, COD and TSS)
- 12 (viii) Ecotoxicity (including both aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems)
- 13 (ix) Radioactivity

14 (B) Human health impacts

- 15 (i) Occupational health effects
- 16 (ii) Human toxicity and Public health effects (excluding work
17 environment)
- 18 (iii) Human social disturbance effects

19 (C) Resource depletion impacts

- 20 (i) Energy consumption
- 21 (ii) Natural resource (renewable and non-renewable) consumption
- 22 (iii) Energy efficiency
- 23 (iv) Water consumption and conservation
- 24 (v) Land use

25 (D) Economic impacts

- 26 (i) Direct corporate cost
- 27 (ii) Indirect corporate cost
- 28 (iii) Future and contingent liability cost
- 29 (iv) Corporate intangible cost
- 30 (v) Societal/External cost (due to human health and environment
31 impact social costs)

32
33 (2) While quantitative results are desired, the practitioner of the study may
34 choose qualitative or semi qualitative metrics (e.g. low, medium, high level; or 1-5
35 rating system) based on data quality. The method of calculating results (e.g.,
36 the characterization model and characterization factors used) shall be identified
37 and documented, including the value-choices and assumptions used.

38
39 (3) The comparative impact assessment shall be conducted by evaluating the
40 results of the alternatives based on potential benefits and tradeoffs versus the
41 original product. The processes resulting in significant impacts for the
42 alternatives versus the original product are then identified. Sensitivity of the
43 results should be quantified by re-evaluating the results considering the
44 maximum (worst acceptable) and minimum (best viable) data for the identified
45 processes.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2 (4) Further improvement shall be considered to mitigate the significant
3 impacts identified. Improvements include changes such as reformulation,
4 process improvements and end-of-life management options. A subsequent
5 iteration of the assessment steps starting with (e) with improvements identified
6 shall be conducted, checking to assure that the system boundary and functional
7 unit are not modified.

8
9 (5) The economic analysis shall provide a range of projected capital costs and
10 operating costs, societal costs, cost savings, and revenues for the alternatives
11 under study in comparison to the original product containing the chemical of
12 concern. All life cycle phases and processes analyzed in the environmental
13 analysis shall be included in the economic analysis. Additional processes and
14 phases may need to be included to adequately assess costs, including, but not
15 limited to external costs.

16
17 (6) The environmental mechanism and decision criteria that relate the
18 information collected in (e) to the impact category in (f) shall be described and
19 documented. The appropriateness of the decision criteria used for deriving the
20 category metrics in the context of the goal and scope of the study shall be
21 described and documented. The results of the impact assessment shall be valid
22 until there is a change in the design, manufacturing or formulation of the product
23 which is being assessed.

24
25 (g) Documentation

26 (1) The results and conclusions of the study shall be completely and
27 accurately documented. The results, data/information, methods and
28 assumptions shall be transparent and presented in sufficient detail to allow the
29 reader to comprehend the assumptions inherent in the study and trade-offs
30 found. For information and data that proves to be significant for the conclusions
31 of the comparison, details about the relevant information collection process and
32 the time when information has been collected shall be documented and
33 disclosed. The document shall also allow the results and interpretation to be
34 used in a manner consistent with the purposes of this section.

35
36 (2) The results of the study shall be made available to the Department
37 within 30 days of a request from the Department in the form of a report that
38 contains, at a minimum, the following sections:

39 A. Administrative Information

- 40 1. the name, title, and affiliation of the person who
41 conducted the study ;
42 2. date of report;
43 3. statement that the study has been conducted in
44 accordance with the requirements of this article.
45

- 1 B. Product System Description
2 1. statement of functional characteristics of the product;
3 2. functional unit for the product and equivalence for the
4 alternative(s) studied;
5 3. a list of and justification for any equivalent life cycle
6 stages and processes omitted if any;
7 4. a description of the system boundary studied.
8
9 C. Data Sources and Data Quality
10 1. sources of data;
11 2. data/information collection procedures;
12 3. calculation procedures;
13 4. validation of data and data quality assessment.
14
15 D. Operational Assumptions
16 1. assumptions about electricity production;
17 2. cut-off criteria for initial inclusion of inputs and outputs
18 in any given process;
19 3. full transparency in terms of value-choices, rationales
20 and expert judgments.
21
22 E. Inventory Analysis
23 1. identification of energy and material inputs and
24 outputs;
25 2. qualitative or quantitative description of processes.
26
27 F. Impact Assessment
28 1. impact categories and category indicators considered,
29 including a rationale for their selection;
30 2. descriptions of or reference to all characterization
31 models or scoring criteria, characterization factors or rating
32 methods used, including all assumptions;
33 3. descriptions of or reference to all value-choices used
34 in relation to impact categories, characterization models,
35 characterization factors, and scoring criteria, if applicable, including
36 justification for their use and their influence on the results;
37 4. the impact evaluation procedures, calculations and
38 results of the comparative study.
39
40 G. Interpretation
41 1. iteration and improvement methodology description
42 considering data ranges for significant processes identified;
43 2. evaluation of the significance of the impact
44 differences found;

1 3. description of the refinements considered to mitigate
2 the impacts of alternatives.
3
4

5 **Section 6xxxx.17. Comparison of Alternatives**

6 (a) The properties of the potential alternatives identified in section 6xxxx.12
7 shall be compared to those of the consumer product in an Alternatives Analysis
8 Findings Report (Report). The Report shall contain, at a minimum, the following
9 sections:

10
11 (b) The first section of the Report shall contain a concise description of the
12 consumer product being evaluated and a description of each potential alternative
13 that was considered pursuant to section 6xxxx.12(a). For each potential
14 alternative that was excluded from consideration, the report shall describe in
15 detail the justification for excluding the potential alternative. The description of
16 the product and alternatives shall be consistent with the requirements of section
17 6xxxx.12(a) and shall include all the factors identified in that section, including:

- 18 (1) the function of the consumer product;
- 19 (2) the function of the chemical of concern in the consumer product;
- 20 (3) performance factors relevant to the specific function of the
21 consumer product and specific function of the chemical of concern in the
22 consumer product.

23
24 (c) The second section of the alternatives analysis report shall contain a
25 report of the results of hazard categorization comparison for all chemicals of
26 concern found in the potential alternatives, pursuant to section 6xxxx.13. If all of
27 the potential alternatives were eliminated from consideration, the report shall
28 describe in detail the justification for elimination.

29
30 (d) The third section of the alternatives analysis report shall contain a
31 comparison of alternatives. The properties of the potential alternatives identified
32 shall be compared to those of the consumer product as depicted in Table XX -
33 Alternatives Analysis Summary.

34 (1) In the summary table, the hazard, exposure and life cycle impacts
35 (ecological impacts, resource consumption impacts, economic impacts) for the
36 consumer product shall be reported using one or a combination of the following
37 methods:

- 38 (A) reported in quantitative terms with clear units,
- 39 (B) reported as high, medium or low impact, as determined by
40 Table XX—Impact Assessment Criteria for Exposure, or
- 41 (C) left blank if information cannot be reported for any given attribute.

42
43 (2) For each alternative that was not eliminated from consideration pursuant
44 to section 6xxxx.13(b), the results of the hazard and exposure assessment and
45 the results of the life cycle impact assessment shall be reported.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2 (3) The attributes of the alternatives shall either be reported in quantitative
3 terms with the same units used for the consumer product in 6xxx.17(d)(1) for
4 the same impact, or tabulated in relation to the consumer product using a
5 qualitative scale as follows:

6 (A) For those attributes in which the potential alternative achieves
7 approximately the same impact assessment value as the consumer product, the
8 comparison is depicted by an equal sign (=).

9 (B) For those attributes for which the impact assessment of the
10 potential alternative is unknown, the comparison is depicted by a question mark
11 (?).

12 (C) For those attributes for which the impact assessment of the
13 potential alternative is known relative to the consumer product, the comparison
14 shall be depicted by a qualitative scale with sufficient detail to express the results
15 of the comparison accurately.

16 (D) An example of a permissible qualitative scale follows:

17 + the alternative is less impactful / less hazardous than the consumer
18 product;

19 ++ the alternative is significantly less impactful / less hazardous than
20 the consumer product;

21 - the alternative is more impactful / more hazardous than the
22 consumer product;

23 -- the alternative is significantly more impactful / more hazardous than
24 the consumer product;.

25 (E) A different qualitative scale may be used for comparison of
26 alternative with the consumer product if the replacement scale contains sufficient
27 detail to determine significant impacts.

28
29 (e) The fifth section of the alternatives analysis report shall describe the
30 process used to decide among alternatives, and report which alternative was
31 chosen, or if no alternatives were chosen. This description shall include the
32 following:

33 (1) Identification of any potential alternatives that are clearly superior to
34 the product with regard to the hazard and exposure impacts;

35 (2) Identification of any potential alternatives that are clearly superior to
36 the product with regard to the ecological impacts;

37 (3) Identification of any potential alternatives that are clearly superior to
38 the product with regard to the resource impacts;

39 (4) Identification of any potential alternatives that are clearly superior to
40 the product with regard to the economic impacts;

41 (5) The decision factors used to either select an alternative or retain
42 the product unchanged;

43 (6) Identification of any attributes that will be significantly more
44 impactful and the dominant life cycle phase where the impact occurs as a result

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 of the selection as determined by comparison of the product and potential
2 alternatives;
3 (7) Any other factors the analyst deems relevant to the decision.
4
5 (f) The sixth section of the alternatives analysis report shall state:
6 (1) the person who conducted the study and their affiliation;
7 (2) date of the report;
8 (3) a signed statement that the study and findings report have been
9 conducted in accordance with the requirements in this article.
10
11 (g) The seventh section of the alternatives analysis report shall describe an
12 implementation plan and schedule for implementing an alternative, if applicable.
13
14

DRAFT

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1

Table XX – Alternatives Analysis Summary

Impacts		Product	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C
Hazard and Exposure Impacts	Acute toxicity				
	Specific target organ toxicity (single exposure)				
	Target organ toxicity (repeated exposure)				
	Adverse eye effects				
	Mutagenicity and genetic toxicity				
	Reproductive toxicity				
	Carcinogenicity				
	Endocrine disruption				
	Respiratory sensitization				
	Skin sensitization				
	Bioaccumulation				
	Aquatic toxicity				
	Hazardous to the ozone layer				
	Occupational Health Effects				
	Other human health and public health effects				
	Human social disturbance effects				
	Dermal contact with COC during product use				
	Potential ingestion of COC during product use				
	Potential inhalation of COC during product use				
	Ecological Impacts	Global warming			
Acidification					
Photochemical smog					
Stratospheric Ozone depletion					
Eutrophication					
Water quality (eg. BOD, COD and TSS)					
Ecotoxicity (including both aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems)					
Radioactivity					
Resource Depletion Impacts	Energy consumption				
	Natural resource (renewable and non-renewable) consumption				
	Energy efficiency				
	Water consumption and conservation				
	Land use				
Economic Impacts	Direct corporate cost				
	Indirect corporate cost				
	Future and contingent liability cost				
	Corporate intangible cost				
	External cost (due to human health and environment impact social costs)				

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2 **Section 6xxxx.18. Compliance**

3 (a) On or before one year from the date the chemicals of concern in a
4 consumer product subject to article X are prioritized pursuant to section 6xxxx.8,
5 the alternative analysis findings report specified in section 6xxxx.17 shall be
6 completed and made publicly available through an electronic submittal process
7 and posting to a publicly available Internet website. The alternative analysis
8 findings report shall also be submitted to the Department upon request within
9 30 days.

10
11 (b) When the alternative analysis is completed, the date of completion shall
12 be added to the supply chain documentation required pursuant to
13 section 6xxxx.9.

14
15 (c) If a safer alternative is not selected for implementation, the following
16 requirements apply:

17 (1) the alternatives analysis process shall be repeated, and the
18 associated Report shall be revised, every two years, with a reasonable effort to
19 identify safer alternatives that do not require a statement of over-riding socio-
20 economic benefit from the continued use of the consumer product. Whenever
21 the alternative analysis is repeated, the most recent date of completion shall be
22 added to the supply chain documentation required pursuant to section 6xxxx.9;
23 and

24 (2) the description of the decision process required by
25 section 6xxxx.17(e) shall include a justification for continuing to use the
26 consumer product, which shall include a statement of over-riding socio-economic
27 benefit. The justification shall include the following at a minimum:

28 (A) a description of how the benefit to society from the continued
29 use of the consumer product outweighs the impacts
30 associated with the chemical of concern in the product

31 (B) a description of any associated costs from continued use of
32 the consumer product

33 (C) a description of why no alternatives are economically or
34 technologically viable as substitutes for the consumer
35 product.

36
37 (d) All information used to conduct the evaluations and studies pursuant to
38 this article shall be made available to the Department upon request within 30
39 days. When making information available, information claimed to be trade secret
40 or confidential business information shall be identified but shall not include
41 chemical hazard information pursuant Health and Safety Code Section 25257(f).
42

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (e) The Department may require revision of any part of an alternatives
2 analysis at any time, including submittal of additional information regarding the
3 properties of chemicals, or any of the hazard, exposure or lifecycle impacts.
4

5 (f) The process specified in this article represents the minimum level of
6 analysis required. In the alternative analysis, a person may conduct a more
7 comprehensive and/or quantitative analysis. Any person may:

- 8 (1) use an independent third party to prepare or validate any or all
9 parts of the analysis.
- 10 (2) collaborate with related associates to prepare any or all parts of the
11 analysis.
- 12 (3) use any established model or alternatives assessment process that
13 includes all of the factors and attributes for alternatives analysis
14 specified in this article.
15

16 **Article XXX Response Actions**

17 **6XXXXX.20 Regulatory Response Actions**

18 **(a) General Response Actions**

- 19 (1) Upon the completion of the alternatives analysis required by article XX,
20 (A) the manufacturer shall take response actions pursuant to this
21 article, if either a consumer product or the alternative to be
22 implemented contains a priority chemical of concern or has a
23 significant impact identified pursuant to section 6XXXX.17, provided
24 the response action is not otherwise prohibited by law; or
25 (B) if the manufacturer implements a safer alternative that does not
26 contain a priority chemical of concern within one (1) year of the
27 completion of the alternative analysis, the manufacturer shall
28 comply with a notification pursuant to subsection (a)(3)(B)2 within
29 90 days of completion of the alternative analysis. The manufacturer
30 shall comply with articles X and XX, if applicable.
31

32
33 (2) **Response Action Implementation Plan.** When a response action is
34 required, a manufacturer responsible for taking the action shall prepare a
35 detailed response action implementation plan. The plan shall be prepared
36 within ninety (90) days from the date the alternative analysis required by
37 article XX has been completed. The plan shall address either the
38 consumer product or the alternative to be implemented. The plan shall
39 include the following:

- 40 (A) name and physical location of the business;
- 41 (B) name of contact person and contact information;
- 42 (C) six digit North American Industry Classification System codes
43 applicable to activities at the business;

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

- 1 (D) number of employees
- 2 (E) identification of the chemicals of concern, and the respective
- 3 priority for each;
- 4 (F) identification of the consumer product, any associated brands,
- 5 and the applicable article X, section 6XXXX.1(a) product
- 6 categories;
- 7 (G) volume(s) of the chemicals of concern being used;
- 8 (H) date the most recent alternative analysis required by article XX
- 9 was completed;
- 10 (I) identification of specific response actions to be taken;
- 11 (J) if applicable, the results of the impact assessment required by
- 12 section 6XXXX.17, including, but not limited to identification of
- 13 significant impacts, the specific product life phase required by
- 14 subsection 6XXXX.16(d) in which the impacts occur, and a
- 15 description of how significant impacts will be mitigated;
- 16 (K) identification of laws prohibiting a required response action or
- 17 required a modification of a response action, if applicable;
- 18 (L) timeline for the implementation of the required response action;
- 19 and
- 20 (M) a description of how each response action will be monitored.

21
22 A manufacturer responsible for taking the response action shall keep a
23 copy of this plan onsite for a period of three (3) years after the last date
24 that the manufacturer made the consumer product subject to the
25 alternative analysis required by article XX available for use in California. A
26 manufacturer shall make the plan available to the Department within thirty
27 (30) days of a written request; and shall make the information generally
28 available to any interested parties by posting the information on the
29 internet.

30
31 **(3) Notification.**

32 (A) Within ninety (90) days from the date the alternative analysis
33 required by article XX has been completed, a manufacturer shall
34 send an electronic notification to the Department. The notification
35 shall include the information specified in subsections
36 6XXXX.20(a)(2)(A)-(I) of the response action implementation plan
37 required by subsection (a)(2) of this section. (B) The manufacturer
38 shall add the following information to the supply chain
39 documentation pursuant to section 6XXXX.9.

- 40 1. the implementation date for the response actions if a
- 41 response action is implemented, or
- 42 2. the date the determination for no further action if a safer
- 43 alternative is implemented.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (C) Notwithstanding subsection (3)(B), if the safer alternative has
2 been implemented and the supply chain documentation is no longer
3 required, then only the notification pursuant to subsection (A) is
4 required.
5

6 (4) If the Department determines the following:

7 (A) the A manufacturer responsible for taking response actions
8 has not taken response action pursuant to subsections (b) and (c)
9 of this section, or

10 (B) the continued availability in California of the consumer product
11 or implemented alternative selected pursuant to section 6xxxx.17,
12 with the implementation of the prescribed response actions, would
13 pose a significant risk to human health or the environment,
14 the Department may impose response actions, as prescribed in
15 subsections (c) and (d) of this section, provided that the response actions
16 are not otherwise prohibited by law.
17

18 (5) The Department may use any data or alternative analysis required by
19 article XX to imposed response actions.
20

21 **(6) Considerations for Department Authorized Response Actions.**

22 The Department shall consider the following when determining whether to
23 impose a response action:

24 (A) Nature of the hazards and potential risk including:

- 25 1. hazardous traits, characteristics, and endpoints;
- 26 2. potential risks to sensitive populations, including but not
27 limited to, infants, children, and pregnant women; and
- 28 3. evaluation of exposure attributes pursuant to section
29 6XXXX.17 that indicate a significant human health or
30 environmental impact; or

31 (B) Effectiveness of the response action and the appropriateness
32 of the time frame for completing the response action identified in
33 the response action implementation plan submitted to the
34 Department pursuant to subsection (a)(2) of this section;

35 (C) Consistency in response actions: The Department will consider
36 how similar situations have been handled in determining the
37 measures to be taken to enforce the regulation; and

38 (D) Duplicative or conflicting requirements: The Department will
39 consider existing requirements imposed by other agencies.
40

41 (7) Not later than sixty (60) days after the Department has provided written
42 notification to a manufacturer responsible for taking response action that
43 the Department has determined that other or additional response actions

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 are required, a manufacturer shall submit a response action
2 implementation plan for those response actions.
3

4 (8) A manufacturer providing information pursuant to this section shall, at
5 the time of the submittal, identify all portions of the information claimed to
6 be a trade secret or confidential business information.
7

8 **(b) Response Actions Criteria**

9 (1) Upon completion of the alternative analysis required by article XX, if a
10 safer alternative has not been implemented, a manufacturer of a
11 consumer product containing a priority chemical of concern shall be
12 subject to the following requirements:

13 **(A) A potential safer alternative exists but is not implemented**

14 1. If the chemical of concern is a priority 1 chemical that has
15 been banned by another governmental agency, and there is
16 a potential safer alternative, a manufacturer shall comply
17 with subsections (c)(2), and (c)(3)(A);

18 2. If the chemical of concern is a priority 1 chemical that has
19 not been banned by another governmental agency, and
20 there is a potential safer alternative, a manufacturer shall
21 comply with subsections (c)(2), and (c)(3)(B); and

22 3. If the chemical of concern is a priority 2 chemical and
23 there is a potential safer alternative, a manufacturer shall
24 comply with subsections (c)(3)(C); and

25 4. If the chemical of concern is a priority 3 chemical and
26 there is a potential safer alternative, a manufacturer shall
27 comply with subsections (c)(3)(D); and

28 **(B) There is no potential safer alternative to be implemented**

29 1. If the chemical of concern is a priority 1 chemical that has
30 been banned by another governmental agency, and If there
31 is no potential alternative; a manufacturer shall comply with
32 subsections (c)(2), and (c)(3)(B);

33 2. If the chemical of concern is a priority 1 chemical that has
34 not been banned by another governmental agency, and
35 there is no potential safer alternative, a manufacturer shall
36 comply with subsections (c)(2), and (c)(3)(C); and

37 3. If the chemical of concern is a priority 2 chemical and
38 there is no safer potential alternative, a manufacturer shall
39 comply with subsections (c)(3)(D).

40 4. If the chemical of concern is a priority 3 chemical and
41 there is no safer potential alternative, a manufacturer shall
42 comply with subsections (c)(3)(E).
43

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (2) Upon completion of the alternative analysis required by article XX, if
2 the attributes prescribed in subsection 6XXXX.17 of the implemented
3 alternative would have significant impacts in California, the manufacturer
4 shall be subject to the following requirements when the evaluation
5 pursuant to section 6XXXX.17 indicates the following:

6 (A) if exposure impacts (for ingestion or inhalation which cannot be
7 mitigated to less than significant) and hazard impacts are significant
8 for:

- 9 i. acute toxicity;
10 ii. carcinogenicity;
11 iii. mutagenicity;
12 iv. reproductive; or
13 v. endocrine disruption;

14 the manufacturer shall be subject to the requirements in
15 subsections (c)(3)(B) of this section when there is a potential safer
16 alternative; and shall be subject to the requirements in subsections
17 (c)(3)(C) of this section when there is no potential safer alternative;
18 and

19 (B) if exposure risks are significant but can be mitigated to less than
20 significant by use or disposal practices which control access or limit
21 exposure associated with the consumer product, the manufacturer
22 shall comply with subsection (c)(2). The labeling requirement
23 pursuant to subsection (c)(2)(A)1 is applicable; and

24 (C) if any attribute impacts are significant at the end of life phase,
25 the manufacturer shall be subject to the requirements in
26 subsections (c)(2), (c)(4), (c)(5)(A), and if applicable (c)(5)(F). The
27 labeling requirement pursuant to subsection (c)(2)(A)2 is
28 applicable; and

29 (D) if exposure risks to workers who are reasonably expected to
30 use the consumer product on a daily or frequent basis are
31 significant, the manufacturer shall be subject to the requirements in
32 subsections (c)(2), (c)(5)(B), and if applicable (c)(5)(F). The labeling
33 requirement pursuant to subsection (c)(2)(A)3 is applicable; and

34 (E) if greenhouse gas emissions or air quality impacts are
35 significant, the manufacturer shall be subject to the requirement in
36 subsection (c)(5)(C), and if applicable (c)(5)(F); of this section; and

37 (F) if water quality impacts, or eutrophication are significant, the
38 manufacturer shall be subject to the requirement in subsection
39 (c)(5)(D), and if applicable (c)(5)(F) of this section; and

40 (G) if ecotoxicity risk is significant, the manufacturer shall be
41 subject to the requirement in subsection (c)(5)(E), and if applicable
42 (c)(5)(F) of this section.
43

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 **(c) Response Actions.** The response actions to be taken when required
2 pursuant to subsection (b) include the following or combination thereof, to the
3 extent that the response actions are not otherwise prohibited by law:
4

5 (1) **No further action.** On or before ninety (90) days from the date the
6 alternative analysis required by article XX has been completed as
7 specified in subsection (a) of section 6XXXX.18, no further action is
8 required if a determination based on alternative analysis has been made
9 that the risk of exposure from continued use of the consumer product is
10 not significant.
11

12 (2) **User Notification/Hazard Communication (Labeling).** On or before
13 one (1) year from the date the alternative analysis required by article XX
14 has been completed, a manufacturer shall provide a label the meets the
15 following requirements:

16 (A) The label shall include the following information, if applicable:

- 17 1. Restricted Use Statement - a description of the specific
18 conditions for use or disposal which mitigate the hazardous
19 traits, hazardous characteristics, and toxic endpoints of the
20 priority chemical of concern to avoid potential significant
21 adverse effects on the environment unless the these
22 impacts have been mitigated by engineered or passive
23 controls which control access or limit exposure of the
24 priority chemical of concern; or
- 25 2. Disposal and end of life management requirements - a
26 description of the "regulatory response restrictions" as
27 specified in subsection (c)(4) of this section, if applicable.
28 This description provides instructions for disposing of any
29 unused product, the product packaging, the product
30 container and product stewardship requirements; or
- 31 3. Worker Protection Warnings - warnings related to the
32 hazards of the priority chemical of concern and the use of
33 the consumer product by workers that may be reasonably
34 expected to use the consumer product on a daily or
35 frequent basis resulting in significant exposures to the
36 priority chemical of concern.
37

38 (B) The information specified in subsection (2)(A) shall be included
39 on one of the following:

40 1. Packaging Label

- 41 i. The label shall be clearly shown on the packaging. If
42 the consumer product is inside one or more layers of
43 packaging, the label shall be shown on any such layer

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 which is likely to be the outermost layer during the
2 distribution or use of the product; and

- 3 ii. The label shall be placed so that it can be read when
4 the package is set down normally; and
5 iii. The dimensions of the label shall be not less than 2
6 inches by 3 inches; and
7 iv. The font on the label must be printed in legible and
8 indelible characters; or

9 2. The information shall be clearly printed on the normal
10 packaging label; or

11 3. The information shall be affixed in some other appropriate
12 manner on packaging too small to allow labeling; or

13 4. The information shall be included in a packaging insert; or

14 5. The information shall be posted on a manufacturer's
15 website.

16
17 **(3) Prohibition.** On or before one (1) year from the date the alternative
18 analysis required by article XX has been completed, a manufacturer of a
19 consumer product shall implement any of the following

20 (A) On and after January 1, 2013 or 2 years after the initial
21 determination of a new priority chemical of concern, whichever date
22 occurs later, consumer products containing a priority chemical of
23 concern shall be prohibited from being made available for use in
24 California.

25 (B) On and after January 1, 2017 or 5 years after the initial
26 determination of a new priority chemical of concern, whichever date
27 occurs later, consumer products containing a priority chemical of
28 concern shall be prohibited from being made available for use in
29 California.

30 (C) On and after January 1, 2022 or 10 years after the initial
31 determination of a new priority chemical of concern, whichever date
32 occurs later, consumer products containing a priority chemical of
33 concern shall be prohibited from being made available for use in
34 California.

35 (D) On and after January 1, 2027 or 15 years after the initial
36 determination of a new priority chemical of concern, whichever date
37 occurs later, consumer products containing a priority chemical of
38 concern shall be prohibited from being made available for use in
39 California.

40 (E) On and after January 1, 2032 or 20 years after the initial
41 determination of a new priority chemical of concern, whichever date
42 occurs later, consumer products containing a priority chemical of
43 concern shall be prohibited from being made available for use in
44 California.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44

(4) End-of-Life Management. On or before one (1) year from the date the alternative analysis required by article XX has been completed, a manufacturer of a consumer product shall implement any of the following strategies for managing and reducing the life cycle impacts of the consumer product, including establishing and maintaining:

- (A) take-back programs; or
- (B) statewide or local recycling or collection programs; or
- (C) statewide or local programs to control priority chemical of concerns or consumer product impacts to the environment.

(5) Additional Notifications On or before ninety (90) days from the date the alternative analysis required by article XX has been completed, a manufacturer or, if applicable, a transferee shall provide the notification as specified in subsection (a)(3) to the following:

- (A) submit the notification to the Integrated Waste Management Board;
- (B) submit the notification to the Department of Industrial Relations;
- (C) submit the notification to the Air Resources Control Board;
- (D) submit the notification to the State Water Resources Control Board; or
- (E) submit the notification to the Department of Fish and Game; or
- (F) submit the notification to any boards, departments, and agencies having jurisdiction over a life cycle attribute with significant impacts.

(6) If the response actions specified in subsection (c) need to be modified or the dates specified in subsection (c) of this section are not reasonably attainable, a manufacturer may petition the Department for a modification pursuant to section 6XXXX.21 of this article.

(d) Response Actions. The following response actions may only be authorized by the Department:

(1) Additional Data. The Department may require a manufacturer or, if applicable, the transferee to furnish and transmit to the Department any information related to the consumer product that contains a priority chemical of concern; or a revised alternative analysis required by article XX;

(2) Restrictions. The Department may require a manufacturer or, if applicable, the transferee to impose restrictions or requirements to control access to or limit exposure to the chemical of concern in the consumer product.

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43

(3) Research and Development. If the manufacturer can demonstrate that research is in progress for the priority chemical of concern, and its potential alternatives, through collaboration with other users of the prioritized chemical of concern or by an independent party, the Department may authorize a research and development proposal provided the manufacturer submits to the Department with following documentation:

- (A) To apply for a research and development waiver, a manufacturer shall provide to the Department a written research and development notice that identifies the following:
1. The substantive elements of the research and development program;
 2. The expected amount of time required for each substantive element;
 3. The processes, pollution control equipment, and emissions which are likely to be affected by the program;
 4. Potential or expected benefits of the program; and
 5. The basis upon which the results of the program will be evaluated.

- (B) The substantive elements of the research and development program, which shall include, but are not limited to:
1. Identification and nature of research on a specific product and/or application of a prioritized chemical of concern,
 2. Design of product with substitute chemicals that are not priority chemicals of concern,
 3. Use of chemical ingredients that are restorative of the environment,
 4. Design chemical products to be effective, but reduce toxicity.
 5. Use chemicals that readily break down into innocuous substances in the environment.
 6. Other criteria as deemed necessary and appropriate.

(C) The research and development program being undertaken shall include a provision for the employment of qualified independent firm(s) to prepare written reports at least annually which evaluate each completed significant stage of the research and development program, including all relevant information and data generated by the program.

(4) Green Chemistry Funding. If no safer alternative exists, the Department may authorize a funding proposal for a Green Chemistry Challenge Grant provided:

- (A) the manufacturer has the ability and intention to comply with the intent of articles x, xx, and xxx;

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 (B) the manufacturer is not otherwise legally required to fund this
2 proposal;

3 (C) the amount of the funding shall exceed by at least 20% the
4 economic benefit of noncompliance during the affected time
5 period;

6 (D) the Department may not play any role in managing or
7 controlling funds that may be set aside or escrowed for funding a
8 green chemistry proposal, but may perform oversight to ensure
9 the proposal is implemented pursuant to the approved provisions;

10 (E) The grant shall primarily support fundamental and applied
11 research in green chemistry in order to provide industry with the
12 chemically viable tools and methods necessary to develop
13 products and processes that are more environmentally benign;
14 and

15 (F) The grant may include research proposals for reformulation or
16 redesign of products, substitution of raw materials, technology
17 modifications, process or procedure modifications, improvements
18 in housekeeping and maintenance, training, inventory control, or
19 other operational and maintenance procedures. Funding may
20 also include any proposal which accomplish any of the following:

- 21 1. extending useful life of commercial products.
- 22 2. reducing materials and resource consumption.
- 23 3. improving water conservation.
- 24 4. reducing water quality impacts.
- 25 5. reducing air emissions.
- 26 6. improved energy efficiency.
- 27 7. reducing production, in-use, and transportation energy
28 inputs.
- 29 8. reducing greenhouse gas emissions.
- 30 9. reducing waste and end-of-life disposal impacts.
- 31 10. reducing public health impacts, including potential
32 impacts to sensitive subpopulations, including infants and
33 children;
- 34 11. reducing environmental impacts; or
- 35 12. any that proposal the Department determines to have
36 environmental merit which do not fit within the above
37 categories but are otherwise fully consistent with the intent of
38 this article.

39
40 **(5) Other response actions.** The Department may determine other
41 response actions that accomplish the requirements of this article.

42
43 **6XXXX.21 Petition for a Variance for Article X, Article XX, and Article XXX**
44 **Requirements**

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1
2 (a) Any manufacturer or if applicable, a transferee may petition the Department in
3 writing to modify or waive any provision in article x or article xx, provided efforts
4 to comply with the requirements can be demonstrated; and a written narrative
5 demonstrating the good faith efforts undertaken to comply is provided.
6

7 (b) The department shall make one of the following findings:

8 (1) The chemical of concern is found to be below “no significant risk
9 levels” for carcinogens or below “maximum allowable daily levels” for
10 chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity;

11 (2) The chemical of concern is insignificant or unimportant as a potential
12 hazard to human health and safety or to the environment;

13 (3) The consumer product is insignificant or unimportant as a potential
14 hazard to human health and safety or to the environment, when managed
15 in accordance with the conditions, limitations, and other requirements
16 specified in the response action;

17 (4) The exposure during use of the consumer product is insignificant
18 potential hazard to human health and safety or the environment;

19 (5) The consumer product is regulated by another governmental agency in
20 a manner that ensures it will not pose a substantial present or potential
21 hazard to human health and safety, and the environment; or

22 (6) A requirement imposed by another public agency provides protection
23 of human health and safety or the environment equivalent to the protection
24 provided by the requirement of this article.
25

26 (c) Upon the completion of the alternatives analysis required by article XX, if a
27 determination has been made to implement a prohibition as a response action as
28 prescribed in subsection 6XXXX.20(c)(3), a manufacturer may petition the
29 Department to allow the continued use of the consumer product, provided there
30 is no safer alternative that is functionally equivalent or has equivalent
31 performance; or there is no safer alternative that is economically and technically
32 viable.
33

34 (d) Each petition must be submitted to the Department by certified mail and must
35 include:

36 (1) The name and address of the petitioner;

37 (2) A statement of the petitioner's proposed request for modification or
38 variance and the specific regulatory requirement being modified; and

39 (3) A statement of the need and justification for the proposed action,
40 including any supporting tests, studies, or other information.
41

42 (e) The Department shall, within 60 days after receipt of an application for a
43 variance pursuant to this section, notify the applicant that the application is

**Published for purposes of Green Ribbon Science Panel review
and public workshop prior to initiation of the public participation
process required by the Administrative Procedures Act**

1 complete and accepted for processing by the Department or that the application
2 is incomplete and what further information is required.

3
4 (f) The Department shall make a tentative decision to grant or deny a petition and
5 shall do the following:

6 (1) publish a 45 day notice of such tentative decision in the California
7 Regulatory Notice Register or on the internet; and

8 (2) make the tentative decision and the scientific support for the decision
9 available on its website;

10 (3) allow interested parties to submit written comments in support of or in
11 opposition to the tentative decision during the notice period;

12 (4) provide responses to the comments submitted within a reasonable
13 time.

14
15 (g) After evaluating all public comments, the Department shall publish its final
16 decision to grant or deny the petition in the California Regulatory Notice Register
17 and on the internet and shall notify the applicant in writing that the request for a
18 variance is granted or denied.

19
20
DRAFT